

City Council

Carl Anduri, Mayor Gina Dawson, Vice Mayor Susan Candell, Council Member Teresa Gerringer, Council Member Wei-Tai Kwok, Council Member

With Clifford Chan General Manager East Bay Municipal Utility District 375 11th Street Oakland, CA 94607

July 27, 2023

Re: EBMUD Lafayette Reservoir Tower

Dear Clifford:

Thank you so much for postponing the public meeting on the reservoir tower. I want to brief you on the citizens advisory team's presentation at Monday's City Council meeting. Board member Coleman attended that meeting.

Gordon Chong, Mason Walters and Matt Bertics of the advisory team presented their findings to the Council and concluded that the City of Lafayette and the broader Regional Recreational Community would be better served if the tower could be seismically strengthened in place in its original configuration as required to meet DSOD's seismic safety requirements, rather than by shortening the tower. By a unanimous vote, the City Council accepted the team's recommendations and directed me to send a letter to you.

Advisory Team's Work

Prior to Monday's meeting, the advisory team spent a considerable amount of time reviewing all the documents that were provided by EBMUD. Their review was guided by the following four principles-

- 1. Protect the public against the threat of risk from a seismic event.
- 2. Recognize and address realistic construction and cost constraints.
- 3. Focus on alternatives presented by EBMUD's consultants rather than proposing experimental or new alternatives.
- 4. Work collaboratively and cooperatively with EBMUD as a professional peer reviewer.

These guiding principles are in alignment with the criteria which EBMUD's consultants have used in their evaluation of the alternatives previously presented to the City Council, i.e., structural effectiveness for safety, environmental conditions including aesthetic and biological sensitivity, constructability, and cost.

Based on the team's review of the materials received from EBMUD, including the recently obtained outlet conduit report, all members agree that a <u>revised</u> version of EBMUD's own Retrofit Alternative #1 - Post Tensioning approach should address all the reported seismic issues with the tower and would not require permanent shortening of the tower or changes to its final appearance. I have attached the July

17, 2023 analysis prepared by advisory team member Walters which describes the revised version of Retrofit Alternative #1 in detail. This analysis was reviewed and discussed with EBMUD and AECOM on July 18, 2023. It should be noted that the analysis focuses on the tower only as the advisory team had not yet received Appendix E. The team has since reviewed Appendix E which covers the outlet conduit and continues to recommend study of the revised version of Retrofit Alternative #1. The advisory team believes that this revised version would be cost-competitive with the tower shortening scheme.

Request

The City of Lafayette respectfully requests that EBMUD and their consulting team undertake the following next steps. The advisory team members are available to explain their findings in greater detail to your staff and consultants.

- 1. Amend the tower evaluation to analyze a revision to Alternative #1, Post Tensioning approach, as proposed by the advisory team.
- 2. Amend the study of the outlet conduit to verify that the full-height tower would not change the plans for retrofitting the outlet conduit.
- 3. Compare the construction cost of the revised scheme to that of the tower shortening scheme. In the cost comparisons, please include all elements of the schemes that were not included in the preliminary cost analysis.

The City Council appreciates EBMUD's willingness to collaborate on this very important endeavor. Thank you, Clifford, for your partnership.

Sincerely,

Niroop K. Srivatsa City Manager